



Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

Thursday, April 8, 2010

LEGAL ACTION REPORT
(*REVISED)

1. Call to Order / Roll Call: 1:03 p.m.

Commissioners: Teresita Majewski (Chair), Patsy Waterfall, Gal Witmer, Demion Clinco, Sharon Chadwick, Kathy Nabours

Staff: Frank S. Podgorski, Michael Taku, Kevin McIlheney, Jonathan Mabry, Aline Torres

2. Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone:

RND 09-05 Rialto Block-Demolition (Chimney) 318 East Congress Street (Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone)

Presentation by Bill Jones, Project Manager, on the demolition of an existing chimney located on the west elevation of the Rialto Theatre building adjacent to the courtyard project for the Rialto Building. Mr. Jones stated that the chimney will be demolished from the top down brick-by-brick to ensure minimum negative impact. Mr. Jones provided a certified engineer's report requested by city staff on the condition of the chimney and current photographs.

Commissioner Nabours arrived at 1:05 p.m.

Some of the salvaged brick will be used to enclose the doorway on the southwest corner of the Rialto Building and the remainder turned over to the Rialto Theatre. Jonathan Mabry, City of Tucson, Historic Program Manager, stated the removal of the chimney will not cause a delisting of the Rialto Theatre in the National Register of Historic Places. Dr. Mabry stated the Rio Nuevo District Board unanimously approved the demolition at their meeting on March 31, 2010. Mr. Jones stated that a total of seven (7') feet of the chimney at the base will remain intact since there is no need to remove the entire chimney to complete the courtyard improvements. Discussion amongst commissioners on completion of the documentation for the chimney with digital photographs on archival grade paper.

Motion by Demion Clinco to recommend approval of the (partial) demolition of the chimney located on the west elevation of the Rialto Theatre building with the condition that the existing chimney be documented through digital photographs on archival paper in addition to documentation provided.

Seconded by Patsy Waterfall.

Original motion amended by Commissioner Clinco to include the remainder of brick (after enclosure of the door opening on the southwest corner of the building) be donated to the Rio Nuevo District Board (Owners of the Rialto Theatre).

Amended motion seconded by Commissioner Waterfall.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 5-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

.....

3. Regular Cases:

HPZ 10-11 Ussishkin-Porch Addition; 228 South 4th Avenue (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone) (Reconsideration of Porch Roof Material)

Presentation on the roof material survey in the existing development zone for proposed metal roofing material (metal standing seam) on the approved rear porch addition attached to an existing single-family dwelling in the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone. Adam Ussishkin, property owner, presented several examples of metal standing seam roof material in this development zone. The roof will have a 3/12 pitch and not be visible from the public right-of-way and the seams will be (12") apart and (1 ¾") in height. Commissioners discussed Mr. Ussishkin's findings and requested he complete a survey of the district for future reference by the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone Advisory Board. Mr. Ussishkin agreed to the subcommittee request and showed the commissioners an initial survey with pictures and a map of structures in the district that contained metal standing seam roof material on principal structures.

Motion by Gal Witmer to recommend approval of the standing seam metal roof material on the rear porch addition with the color as presented. If there is any change, the property owner is to return through the historic review/approval process.

Seconded by Patsy Waterfall.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 5-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

.....

HPZ 10-12 Rios-Demolition/Rehabilitation; 426 East 18th Street (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone) (Reconsideration of Front Porch)

Presentation by Jude Gillum, contractor, on the reconsideration of the front porch material discussed at the last plans review subcommittee meeting on Thursday, March 25, 2010. Commissioners recommended approval of the demolition/rehabilitation of this bungalow residence located in the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone with the condition that Mr. Gillum return with more information on the front porch rehabilitation, specifically; composition of the front porch columns. Mr. Gillum reported the columns were constructed of burnt adobe and stuccoed over time. He proposes to use burnt adobe with brick face on the surface. Commissioners requested additional detail on the front porch foundation.

Motion by Gal Witmer to recommend approval of the front porch rehabilitation with the proposed materials and a strong emphasis on finding like-for-like dimensioned brick (burnt adobe). The

approved drawings are to match the foundation as shown in the photograph prior to historic stamping approval by city staff.

Seconded by Sharon Chadwick.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 5-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

.....

(*REVISED ITEM-Please see amended motion) HPZ 10-17 City of Tucson/Parks & Recreation-Catalina Park-Rehabilitation; 941 North 4th Avenue (West University Historic Preservation Zone) (Revised Plan)

Commissioner Witmer recused herself from this discussion/recommendation due to her involvement as a neighborhood resident.

Presentation by Kevin McIlheny, City of Tucson, Parks & Recreation Department on the rehabilitation of the Catalina Park located in the West University Historic Preservation Zone. Jonathan Mabry stated the historic integrity of the park must be maintained throughout the rehabilitation process, the current rehabilitation proposal should in no way prevent future rehabilitation proposals and any new facilities added should not disturb existing facilities. Chair Majewski began the discussion by reading a letter from R. Brooks Jeffery, Director, Drachman Institute, University of Arizona, supporting re-evaluation of this proposal based on City of Tucson Development Zone Standards and the Secretary of Interior Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. Mr. McIlheny proceeded to outline the proposed improvements to modernize the pool facility without creating a false sense of history. Solar lighting will be eliminated based on neighborhood input and lighting will occur off of existing and proposed buildings. The perimeter fence of the pool area will be powder coated for durability with clay tiles on the proposed ramada and storage building as proposed. Colors for the project were presented along with a landscaping plan that conforms to City of Tucson standards. Mr. Walter Rogers, landscape architect, presented all the color palates for the tile, buildings and amenities as well as the landscape plan.

Commissioner Waterfall left the meeting at 2:42 p.m.

A combination palm/pistache/native mesquite/desert willow/agave will be installed. Commissioners asked if another type of roof tile other than clay tiles such as asphalt (as used in the development zone on residential buildings) could be substituted. Commissioner Clinco stated the letter from the neighborhood residents dated April 5, 2010, addresses the criteria outlined in the Development Standards and Secretary of the Interior Standards. Dr. Mabry suggested the proposed improvements should differentiate the existing park elements from the proposed park elements and not create a false sense of history.

Discussion and suggestions by the commissioners on the roof of the proposed shower and grey water run-off (should be reviewed and approved by Pima County Health Department). The pump house roof should be asphalt shingle with perforated steel sides (walls).

Motion by Kathy Nabours to recommend a change of mass to the proposed ramada (smaller); change of roof tile from clay to asphalt; incorporate more Spanish colonial features; Create clear

viewsheds from each direction through the parkscape; and submit a color palate more acceptable that is compatible with surrounding neighborhood residences.

Seconded by Demion Clinco.

Further discussion (no vote).

(*REVISED) Amended motion by Commissioner Nabours to incorporate more elements to the historical context of the quadrafoil and the inclusion of more trees around the inside of the ring; Pay particular attention to the pump house view sheds-the proposed tile is approved as submitted with color to match existing structures. Metal surrounding the walls is approved as submitted or a smoth sand finish masonry block wall with the size of the pump house reduced as much as possible; Incorporate more Spanish Revival features-the clay tile is too heavy and massive; A pergola with shade cloth is the preferred option over the shade structure as presented by the neighborhood or asphalt shingles for the ramada; Add more trees and grass to the plan; Lighting plan is acceptable but historic lighting fixtures would be better; Pay more attention to the symmetry, i.e. quadrafoil design; Keep the proposed shade structure and the playground equipment in scale; Install a graywater recovery system with the approval of the Pima County Health Department; Use asphalt shingles or a shade cloth for the pump house; The consideration of the concrete paths forming the "X" be replaced with decomposed granite; The asymmetrical sidewalk on the east replaced with the quadrafoil design and more grass on the east quadrant is the preferred option; Colors to be reviewed at the next plans review subcommittee meeting on Thursday, April 22nd and colors should be compatible with the surrounding residential properties.

Amended motion seconded by Demion Clinco.

Motion as amended passed unanimously 4-0. Chair Majewski voted.

4. Current Issues for Information/Discussion:

- a. Minor Reviews: HPZ 10-18 Gentle Ben's Brewery-Patio Expansion (Front); 865 East University Boulevard (West University Historic Preservation Zone)
- b. Appeals: No appeals at this time.
- c. Zoning Violations: Zoning violations in historic preservation zones are reported to the Code Enforcement section of Community Services at 792-CITY. A city inspector is assigned to the case and if a zoning violation is verified, the property owner is referred to Zoning Administration for completion of the historic review/approval process in order to abate the zoning violation.
- d. Historic Preservation Zone Development Standards: Jonathan Mabry reported that the next training session will be in May, 2010, for the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone on how to conduct good historic reviews of proposed projects.

5. Call to the Audience: No one to speak.

6. Meeting adjourned at 3:39 p.m.

